

SUBCOMMITTEE BALLOT REPORT D02.B0 (06-01)

BALLOT ISSUE DATE: 05/04/06 CLOSING DATE: 06/05/06 NEXT SUB COMMITTEE MEETING IS 06/25/06 IN TORONTO CANADA
ITEMS WITHOUT NEGATIVES WILL BE ON NEXT MAIN COMMITTEE BALLOT

STAFF MANAGER: DAVID R BRADLEY

SUBCOMMITTEE OFFICERS: SUB CHRNM JOSEPH M FRANKLIN
SUB V-C TRACEY KING
SUB SEC LEWIS A WILLIAMS

NO OF ITEMS	BALLOTS SENT	BALLOTS RETURNED	PERCENT RETURN
D02.B000	1	48	41
			85.41

Please note that only voting members are counted in the tally of ballots. Also note that negative votes and comments from voting and non-official voting members shall be considered in accordance with the "Regulations Governing ASTM Technical Committees". Ballot report information and statements accompanying negative votes and comments shall not be reproduced or circulated in whole or part, outside of ASTM Committee activities, except with the approval of the Chairman of the committee having jurisdiction and President of the Society.

ITEM	SUB	ACTION		AFF	NEG	ABST	PCNT
001	B0	REVISION OF D4485-06	D02.B000	27.00	1.00	13.00	96.42
		TECHNICAL CONTACT : LYLE O BOWMAN					
		WORK ITEM: WK10881					
		TABLE 1					
		NEGATIVE VOTERS:					
		LYLE O BOWMAN					
		COMMENTS:					
		DAVID M STEHOUWER PH D					
		DOUGLAS E DECKMAN					
		THOMAS J COUSINEAU					
		* ABDUL H CASSIM					
		* CHRISTIAN CASTANIEN					

* INDICATES NON-OFFICIAL VOTING MEMBER

Negative

Date: 5/8/2006
Ballot Number: D02.B0 (01-06) Close Date: JUNE 05, 2006
Item Number: 001 REVISION OF D4485-06 SPECIFICATION FOR Performance of Engine Oils WK10881
TABLE 1(SEE VOLUME 05.02)
TECHNICAL CONTACT: LYLE O BOWMAN
JBFOODIE@COMCAST.NET
(415) 479-3004
Member's Name: LYLE O BOWMAN
Address: 728 MONTECILLO RD
SAN RAFAEL CA 94903
Phone Nr: 4154793004 Fax Nr:
Email Address: JBFOODIE@COMCAST.NET
File Attachment: [000102662_D02B0000106_1.doc](#)
Statement:

I'm voting negative because the ambiguous term 'Anchor' is used for the mid-range test result values in the proposed D 4485 engine test merit systems contained in this ballot.

The mid-range test result values in D 4485 engine test merit systems are particularly important, because if candidate oil test results exactly duplicate the mid-range values, the total merits received will equal 1000, the minimum passing merits total.

Previously, when the Mack T-10 specification limits were discussed in a HDEOCP Meeting, the panel agreed that the term 'Target', rather than 'Anchor', was more descriptive of what was intended for the mid-range test result values in the proposed merit system. Subsequently, the T-10 specification limits, including the term 'Target', are now contained in Specification D 4485.

Definitions of the term 'Anchor', such as "a reliable support" and "something that serves to hold an object firmly", seem irrelevant for describing what the mid-range test result values in a D 4485 engine merit system represent.

In contrast, definitions for the term 'Target', such as "a mark to shoot at" and "a goal to be achieved", are very relevant in describing accurately what the mid-range test result values represent in D 4485 engine test merit systems, particularly in terms of the merits received; i.e., the mid-range, or 'Target', values are the marks to shoot at to achieve a goal of 1000 merits, minimum, a passing score.

Because of the precedent of using 'Target' in the MackT-10 merit system, and because of the forgoing discussion of the ambiguous term 'Anchor' and the contrasting relevancy of the term 'Target', I cannot support the use of the term 'Anchor' in this ballot.

Lyle Bowman

Affirmative with Comment

Date: 5/5/2006
Ballot Number: D02.B0 (01-06) Close Date: JUNE 05, 2006
Item Number: 001 REVISION OF D4485-06 SPECIFICATION FOR Performance of Engine Oils WK10881
TABLE 1(SEE VOLUME 05.02)
TECHNICAL CONTACT: LYLE O BOWMAN
JBFOODIE@COMCAST.NET
(415) 479-3004
Member's Name: DAVID M STEHOUWER PH D
Address: FLEETGUARD EMISSIONS SOLUTIONS
4963 WEST HARVARD CT
COLUMBUS IN 47203
Phone Nr: 8123789825 Fax Nr:
Email Address: DMSTEHOUWER@COMCAST.NET
File Attachment:
Statement:
Under Elastomer Compatability, the limits for Vamac G should be in the table with the other elastomers.

Affirmative with Comment

Date: 6/1/2006
Ballot Number: D02.B0 (01-06) Close Date: JUNE 05, 2006
Item Number: 001 REVISION OF D4485-06 SPECIFICATION FOR Performance of Engine Oils WK10881
TABLE 1(SEE VOLUME 05.02)
TECHNICAL CONTACT: LYLE O BOWMAN
JBFOODIE@COMCAST.NET
(415) 479-3004
Member's Name: DOUGLAS E DECKMAN
Address: EXXON MOBIL
PAULSBORO RESEARCH LAB
600 BILLINGSPORT RD RM 48231
PAULSBORO NJ 08066-0480
Phone Nr: 8562242658 Fax Nr: 8562243613
Email Address: DOUG_DECKMAN@EXXONMOBIL.COM

File Attachment:

Statement:

(1) The "EGR" should be removed from the names of the engine tests -- T-12, ISM, ISB, and C13 -- since this is not part of the names for these tests. This is particularly true since the C13 uses ACERT technology, not cooled EGR

(2) Seal Requirement Tables -- although Vamac G is not part of D7216, it would be useful to modify the table to include Vamac G to have all five elastomer compatibility requirements in the same format.

Affirmative with Comment

Date: 6/6/2006
Ballot Number: D02.B0 (01-06) Close Date: JUNE 05, 2006
Item Number: 001 REVISION OF D4485-06 SPECIFICATION FOR Performance of Engine Oils WK10881
TABLE 1(SEE VOLUME 05.02)
TECHNICAL CONTACT: LYLE O BOWMAN
JBFOODIE@COMCAST.NET
(415) 479-3004

Member's Name: THOMAS J COUSINEAU
Address: AFTON CHEMICAL CORP
500 SPRING STREET
RICHMOND VA 23218-2158

Phone Nr: 8047886282 Fax Nr: 8047886244
Email Address: TOM.COUSINEAU@AFTONCHEMICAL.COM

File Attachment:

Statement:

Two editorial comments/questions

On page 5, should ASTM D 7216 Seal Compatibility Polyacrylate Elongation limits be (+ 10 / -35) rather than (+ 20 / -35)?

For A1.1.1 and A1.1.2 should CI-4 PLUS be included?

Affirmative with Comment

Date: 5/17/2006
Ballot Number: D02.B0 (01-06) Close Date: JUNE 05, 2006
Item Number: 001 REVISION OF D4485-06 SPECIFICATION FOR Performance of Engine Oils WK10881
TABLE 1(SEE VOLUME 05.02)
TECHNICAL CONTACT: LYLE O BOWMAN
JBFOODIE@COMCAST.NET
(415) 479-3004
Member's Name: ABDUL H CASSIM
Address: CATERPILLAR INC.
BUILDING H3000
RENCH RD AT OLD GALENA RD
MOSSVILLE IL 61552
Phone Nr: 3095789096 Fax Nr: 3095783653
Email Address: cassim_abdul_h@cat.com
File Attachment:
Statement:

In Table 3C, the C13 is qualified as and (EGR) engine. This is incorrect. The C13 ACERT 2004 engine does not use EGR technology. The wording and parantheses should be removed from the table and simply addressed as C13

Affirmative with Comment

Date: 5/15/2006
Ballot Number: D02.B0 (01-06) Close Date: JUNE 05, 2006
Item Number: 001 REVISION OF D4485-06 SPECIFICATION FOR Performance of Engine Oils WK10881
TABLE 1(SEE VOLUME 05.02)
TECHNICAL CONTACT: LYLE O BOWMAN
JBFOODIE@COMCAST.NET
(415) 479-3004
Member's Name: CHRISTIAN CASTANIEN
Address: LUBRIZOL ADDITIVES
29400 LAKELAND BLVD
WICKLIFFE OH 44092
Phone Nr: 4403472973 Fax Nr:
Email Address: CCA@LUBRIZOL.COM

File Attachment:

Statement:

A number of editorial changes were suggested and not incorporated. These changes will come up again and need to be incorporated in a timely manner.